Lessons Learned
The Effectiveness of Labour Market and Social Programs for Unemployed Older Workers

Technical Report #2

Evaluation and Data Development
Strategic Policy
Human Resources Development Canada

September 1998

SP-AH093T2-09-98E
(également disponible en français)

Table of Contents

1. Introduction 1

2. Conceptual Framework 5
- 2.1 Policy Goals and Orientations 5
- 2.2 Program Design: Client Groups and the Extent of Targeting 6
- 2.3 Program Effects 6

3. General Labour Market and Social Programs 9
- 3.1 Canadian Jobs Strategy 10
- 3.2 Canada Employment Centres 10
- 3.3 Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program 11
- 3.4 Canada Manpower Mobility Program 11
- 3.5 Canada and Quebec Pension Plans 11
- 3.6 Community Futures 12
- 3.7 Employment Insurance 12
- 3.8 Industrial Adjustment Service 13
- 3.9 National Training Program 13
- 3.10 The Atlantic Groundfish Strategy 14
- 3.11 Post-TAGS 16

4. General Programs with Older Workers as a Target Group 17
- 4.1 Employability Improvement Program 17
- 4.2 Industry and Labour Adjustment Program 19
- 4.3 Outreach 20
- 4.4 Human Rights Codes and the Charter 21

5. Programs Specifically for Older Workers 23
- 5.1 Adjustment Assistance Benefits Program 23
- 5.2 Job Finding Clubs 24
- 5.3 Labour Adjustment Benefit Program 25
- 5.4 NB Job Corps 26
- 5.5 Options 45+ 27
- 5.6 Program for Older Worker Adjustment 28
- 5.7 Transitions 30

6. Lessons Learned 31
- 6.1 Informing Us: Some General Findings 31
- 6.2 Cautioning Us: What Has Not Worked Well 33
- 6.3 Encouraging Us: What Has Worked Well 35

Bibliography 39

List of Tables

Table 1 General Programs 9

Table 2 Programs with Older Workers as a Target Group 17

Table 3 Programs Specifically for Older Workers 24

Table 4 Labour Market Impacts of Programs by Policy Goals 33

Table 5 Labour Market Impacts by Program Design 34

Table 6 Effective Adjustment Programs for Unemployed Workers: A Summary Overview of Characteristics 36

1. Introduction

"A concerted and enduring public policy focus on facilitating rapid economic adjustment and easing problems of transition and concomitant adjustment costs clearly must be assigned a central role in any modernized country's economic, social and political priorities."

Michael J. Trebilcock (1986: 335)

"Programs for younger Canadians are important, but excluding older workers from training and job opportunities will lead to equally serious and chronic labour market problems."

Andrew Aitken (1995: 6)

"In summary, our analysis suggests that older displaced workers, because they are too young from a pension policy standpoint and too old in the context of the labour market, fall through the cracks of public policy."

L. Suzanne LeBlanc and Julie Ann McMullin (1997: 301)

In recent decades, significant economic and industrial restructuring, technological changes and trade liberalization have prompted governments around the world to establish measures for assisting in the labour market adjustment of workers. Demographic trends are also bringing about changes in the composition of the labour market. Falling birth rates and increased life expectancy have contributed to the aging of the population and the gradual maturing of the labour force. Combined, these developments have resulted in a number of employment-related problems for the older segments of the work forces in industrial nations.

Contemporary labour market experiences of older workers in Canada include several troubling trends as well as several barriers to re-employment for those displaced. As a group, older workers are far less likely to experience job loss than younger workers, but when they do lose their jobs, older workers tend to remain unemployed for longer periods. They experience larger average wage losses upon re-employment than other age groups. They may well exhaust their Employment Insurance benefits and have to resort to social assistance, the public welfare program of last resort. The proportion of involuntary job loss by older workers has increased over the last ten years. Displaced older workers are less likely to have a private pension from their employer or investment income than other labour force leavers (LeBlanc and McMullin, 1997). Older workers are overrepresented among discouraged unemployed workers — those who have abandoned their job search — and are then not counted as part of the formal labour force and unemployment statistics. When they find work, unemployed older workers are more likely to obtain temporary employment compared to younger workers. Displaced older workers tend to have been in low paying jobs, meaning they have smaller retirement pensions than older workers who have left the work force for other reasons, resulting in greater reliance on government old age benefits. Many, in fact, receive little if any severance payments.

Beyond a drop in income and living standard, the costs include personal despair, family stresses, and feelings of rejection and anger.

In addition, the literature indicates that older workers face a number of systemic barriers to obtaining employment and training which younger individuals may not face. In brief, these barriers are: a lack of experience and skills in job searching; life-long skills no longer in demand and the lack of relevant skills for positions in growth industries and sectors of the economy; lower levels of literacy and formal educational attainment; less willing to be geographically and/or occupationally mobile for an employment opportunity, for reasons of costs and risks; negative stereotyping by employers, the media, and private as well as public employment agencies about the productivity of older workers resulting in employer reluctance to hire or (re)train older workers; social, managerial and political pressures on older workers to step aside to help address youth unemployment, reduce payroll costs and downsize organizations; employers' unwilling to invest in training older workers because they are often perceived as a poor investment with a short-term payback for the firm; and, job-related training programs are often inaccessible and or inappropriate to the needs and interests of older workers (Betcherman, Leckie and McMullen, 1997; CLMPC, 1990: 26-28; Dunn, 1985; Morrison, 1996; Tindale, 1991).

Since the 1960s, Canadian governments have established various programs for dealing with some of the labour market challenges faced by certain groups of unemployed older workers. Many of these will be briefly surveyed in this report. Perhaps the most prominent policy effort to date, the Program for Older Worker Adjustment (POWA), a federal-provincial cost shared program which ran for a decade, was terminated in 1997. Despite the demise of POWA, federal and provincial governments appear to be working on the assumption that a need remains for programming aimed at improving the labour market adjustment of unemployed older workers or easing them out of the labour force. It is timely, therefore, to review the experience of past and current labour market and social programs for older worker adjustment.

What has been tried? What has and has not worked well? What are the features of effective programming for unemployed older workers? What further information do we need to generate? Lessons learned from experience can inform discussions on what new approaches and measures should be developed to help older workers adapt to the ever changing labour market. Accordingly, the objectives of this report are to (i) synthesize findings from the policy literature and evaluation studies on Canadian labour market and social programs commenting, where possible, on the methodological underpinnings of program evaluation results, as well as highlighting the impacts of these programs on unemployed older workers; (ii) draw general lessons from this experience and identify program design and delivery features associated with effective results. This synthesis includes a review of a technical report previously prepared by Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC, 1997) and incorporates additional information which deals with a wider range of programs that go beyond traditional labour market adjustment measures.

We are interested in several aspects of labour market and social policy for older workers (OECD, 1994, 1995). In particular, the survey examines 21 programs, including industrial, sectoral and worker adjustment programs; employment counselling, mobility assistance and training services; community economic development initiatives; human rights codes; and different kinds of income benefits. Most of the programs reviewed here are federal measures while a few are federal-provincial or provincial initiatives. The report does not examine trade protection measures like import restrictions, regional development programs, corporate "bail-outs"or non-tariff barriers like subsidies to domestic firms. In general, the adjustment effects of these policy instrument has been negative with respect to facilitating corporate restructuring and labour mobility (Saunders, 1984; Trebilcock, 1986).

"Older workers," unless otherwise specified, refers to labour force participants between the ages of 45 to 64. Of course, there are many groups within this age category such as women, visible minorities and persons with disabilities. The focus of the analysis in this report is on the general characteristics and experiences of this social category. The report uses the term unemployed older worker rather than displaced or discouraged older worker. Speaking of displaced older workers emphasizes just one cause of joblessness — plant closures and relocations — which actually constitutes a small share of older worker job loss in Canada. Discouraged older workers refer to persons no longer looking for, or expecting to finding paid employment. Retirement for them is a forced and involuntary decision (Tindale, 1991). The focus of this report is on transitions rather than "shocks" to the economy. Unemployed older workers are persons between 45 and 64 who have experienced involuntary separation from their employment, are available for work and are seeking a new paying job. For 1997, the labour force participation rate of Canadians between 45 to 64 years of age was 67.9 percent, slightly higher than the overall average of 64.8 percent, and the unemployment rate was 6.9 percent, lower than the national rate of 9.2 percent. Still, these figures mean that 304,000 older workers were unemployed in 1997, representing 21.5 percent of total unemployment (Statistics Canada, 1998).

The rest of this report is organized as follows. Section two presents a conceptual framework for the review. Section three discusses experiences of general labour market and social programs for unemployed older workers. Section four describes the experience of general programs that contain targeting for unemployed older workers as a client group. Section five discusses the effectiveness of programs specifically for older workers. Section six presents general lessons drawn from evaluations and literature on these programs.

103-00673/

2. Conceptual Framework

To organize the information on what has been tried and with what results a descriptive conceptual framework is presented. This framework sets the boundaries of the report and highlights the key policy choices and issues under review. There are three levels to the framework. One level relates to the primary focus and aim of the policies and programs; the second deals with program design; and the third concerns the range of effects and outcomes of the programs.

2.1 Policy Goals and Orientations

Within the first level of analysis are four possible policy goals: compensation, reintegration, regeneration and integration. Each is briefly described below.

As *compensation*, unemployed older worker adjustment is about providing replacement income, extending unemployment benefits, offering pre-retirement benefits and other forms of bridging income until pension entitlements are available, or encouraging early retirement. The goal is "to compensate workers who unexpectedly experience hardship as a result of the economy's adaptation to changes in the technology and/or the international economic environment" (Saunders, 1984: 1). These measures tend to facilitate the withdrawal of workers from the labour force.

With *reintegration*, the focus of adjustment policies is on promoting the re-entry of unemployed workers into the labour force by offering employment development services, wage subsidies or direct job creation program opportunities. The goal here is to direct displaced workers into growth areas or occupations expected to be in demand.

Regeneration as a strategy is directed at revitalizing local economic development and mobilizing community resources in order to create new business and employment opportunities. The goal is to create new job opportunities in place and thus contribute to community stability and vitality. The re-entry of displaced workers is thus into a transformed labour market.

The *integration* approach deals with older workers while still employed, perhaps in declining firms or industries, and seeks to enable these workers to remain in employment. The goal is to anticipate changes and prevent displacement and redundancy among older workers. Integrative measures include dismissal protection, human rights provisions on age discrimination, work adjustment/job sharing and work-time reduction (Casey and Bruche, 1981; CEIAC, 1985).

These four goals relate to, and usefully extend the terms of the debate on "passive" versus "active" approaches in labour market and social policy. The question is often posed whether passive forms of programming ought to be cut back and greater emphasis placed on active measures. Compensation measures are usually deemed to be passive while re-integrative measures are called active. Even if these are appropriate terms to use, they

restrict the full range of available options. What has been called regenerative measures are in effect *interactive* activities involving community partnerships among public, private and non-profit organizations. And the intent of integrative measures is to be *proactive* in managing changes to economic changes and an aging workforce. Listing these four orientations raises the matter of how clear and consistent these goals are in actual programs and services for older workers and other groups. The focus in this report is on compensatory and re-integrative provisions since this has largely been the older worker policy mix in Canada.

2.2 Program Design: Client Groups and the Extent of Targeting

The second level of the conceptual framework deals with program design choices for how to deliver services and benefits to older workers. One approach is through broad-based programming geared, for the most part, to serve the general working force population or, at times, a specific industry or sector. These are non-targeted adjustment, employment and income support programs to which older workers may be eligible and gain access. Program examples are Canada Employment Centres, Employment Insurance, The Atlantic Groundfish Strategy (TAGS) and the National Training Program. Another design approach is to include older workers as a specific target group in mainstream programs alongside other client groups. Examples are federal and provincial human rights laws, the Employability Improvement Program, the Industry and Labour Adjustment Program and the Outreach program. Still another approach is to design programs directed specifically at, and exclusively for displaced or unemployed older workers. The age definition of older worker can and does vary among such programs. The POWA (ages 55-64), Job Finding Clubs (45 and over) and NB Job Corps (50 to 65) are Canadian examples of this type of programming.

This aspect of the framework points to the nature of the relationship between program design and program impacts. In the social policy literature, mainstream or universal programs have long been seen as preferable for clients in terms of being non-stigmatizing, well-resourced and of relatively good quality. Yet is this the case for unemployed older workers? Have they been better served by the general labour market programs? Or are targeted, selective programs more likely to be effective in overcoming the barriers older workers face in obtaining training and new employment?

2.3 Program Effects

Program effects and outcomes represent the third level of the conceptual framework. A review of program evaluation studies and the labour adjustment literature yielded seven kinds of impacts which may be discerned after participation in a program. These are:

- **Labour market outcomes:** developing a training culture among older workers, enhanced job search skills and employability, finding employment which is not a displacement or substitution of others, full-time versus part-time jobs, earnings level of new job, stability of the job, and whether there are fringe benefits with a new job.

- **Retirement:** the extent to which a program encourages early retirement and exit from the labour force; whether retirement was voluntary or not and older workers were emotionally and financially prepared.

- **Employment equity:** the degree to which programs serve members of groups which have traditionally been under-represented and disadvantaged in the labour market, including Aboriginal peoples. women and persons with disabilities.

- **Social policy effects:** reduced reliance on income assistance, employment insurance and other government transfers and support services; and, with employment, increased entitlement to Canada/Quebec Pension Plan benefits.

- **Program delivery effects:** the nature of working relationship between trainers/counsellors and program participants and whether programs were delivered in a non-stigmatizing manner.

- **Quality of life:** enhanced sense of self-esteem by clients, confidence in their work-related abilities, feelings of contribution to society, health status, and general life satisfaction.

- **Civic engagement and community social capital:** individuals remaining in the community after layoff and participating in the generation of economic and employment development opportunities; enhanced community capacity to assess local needs, develop and deliver locally-based solutions; formation of consultative and planning bodies; level of formal volunteer activity by program participants; mobilizing of inter-agency and inter-sectoral partnerships.

Several points can be made with respect to the history of evaluation studies and the above list of program effects. First, other outcomes, such as the cost-effectiveness of a program from the viewpoint of governments, were not often found in the evaluation studies reviewed. Second, effectiveness in most of the evaluations concentrate on labour market outcomes; that is, the success of unemployed older workers in accessing training and related programs, and in gaining paid employment after participating in such programs. Third, after the passage of the *Employment Equity Act* in 1985 and its influence on the design of the Canadian Jobs Strategy (Prince and Rice, 1989), and other measures, certain programs and their evaluations have addressed employment equity impacts. Fourth, among more recent evaluations of contemporary programs, in the 1990s in particular, there is greater attention to what can be called non-traditional impacts such as social policy effects and, in some cases, implications for civic engagement and community social capital. Lastly, the first four types of program effects identified above are the stuff of summative evaluations. That is, these effects or outcomes are usually measured to determine a program's effectiveness in meeting objectives in order to generalize findings and apply the lessons elsewhere. The final three types of program effects relate more to formative evaluations. That is, they deal with the profile of participants, their perceptions

and experiences of programs, and delivery processes in order to gain a better understanding of a specific group of people in a specific setting with specific policy interventions.

Over time, then, there has been a tendency to broaden the range of program effects considered, increasing the complexity of the evaluation task.

3. General Labour Market and Social Programs

A notable feature of Canadian public policy for older workers is that most of the services and benefit this group receives are delivered through general programs. As clients of labour market and social programs, older workers are generally more established than other segments of Human Resources Development Canada's (HRDC) clientele. Older workers are more likely to be married, to own their own house and to have dependents. Compared to groups such as youth, social assistance recipients and persons with disabilities, older workers have a stronger attachment to the workforce, more stable employment histories and thus more likely to have higher paying jobs. Evidence and information contained in evaluation studies and the general literature (listed in the bibliography) on the effectiveness of programs is summarized in Tables 1 to 3. The tables present a range of policies by program design, policy goal and labour adjustment effects.

TABLE 1
General Programs

Program	Policy Goal	Labour Adjustment Effects
Canadian Jobs Strategy	Re-integration	moderate positive
Canada Employment Centres	Re-integration	weak positive
Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program	Re-integration, Integrative	moderate positive
Canada Manpower Mobility	Re-integration	weak positive
Canada/Quebec Pension Plans	Compensation	positive?
Community Futures	Regeneration	negative to weak positive
Employment Insurance	Compensation/Re-integration	negative to weak positive
Industrial Adjustment Services	Re-integration	negative to weak positive
National Training	Re-integration	weak positive
The Atlantic Groundfish Strategy (TAGS)	Compensation, Re-integration and Regeneration	weak positive

Sources: Saunders 1984; Trebilcock 1986; various HRDC evaluation reports listed in the bibliography.

Some of the evaluations date back several years, at least one to the early 1980s. Some of the programs assessed no longer exist and others have undergone changes, at times major transformations, as in the case of unemployment insurance. Second, this assessment of adjustment effects is based on the best information available of the outcomes for unemployed older workers. The effects of these programs for other groups and the overall evaluation of a program may well differ from that for older workers. Third, there is an

absence of formal evaluations in the Canadian literature of the impacts of general programs on the older segment of the client population. The same is true of studies in the United States (HRDC, 1997). There are numerous general programs to which older workers have access, yet information on the effectiveness of these programs for older persons is limited. Where formal evaluations have been conducted, studies have generally not reported on program effects with respect to improving the employability of older participants.

3.1 Canadian Jobs Strategy

The literature on the Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS) illustrates this point. A number of studies (CEIAC 1988; Prince and Rice, 1989; CLMPC 1990; LeBlanc and McMullin 1997) point to the under-representation of older workers as participants in the programs within the CJS. Older individuals represented less than 8 percent of participants in 1987-88, for example, even though older workers accounted for about 25 percent of the labour force. Older workers were not one of the designated target groups in the CJS, which were women, Aboriginal people, visible minorities, social assistance recipients and persons with disabilities. We learn little about the impacts of the programs on unemployed older workers other than the speculation (CEIAC, 1988) that the program design discouraged take-up by this age group.

3.2 Canada Employment Centres

Canada Employment Centres (CECs) offer employment counselling, placement and information services to the general population of clients seeking these services. The literature is fairly critical of the limited effectiveness of CECs, especially for older workers. Saunders (1984) reported that many job seekers receive no job referrals and few receive a job with CEC assistance. A study of CECs by Dunn (1985) looked at their effectiveness in providing services to older workers. Dunn surveyed 616 unemployed individuals aged 45 and older to obtain information concerning their employment-related needs and the methods used by CEC staff in responding to these needs. Only 28 percent of CEC registered older workers indicated that training programs or courses available through the CEC suited their needs, and many of these people had to wait six months or more for the training to begin. Dunn concluded that the quality and responsiveness of front-end CEC services were inadequate and often lacked sensitivity to the needs of unemployed older workers. Many CECs did not possess the financial and human resources necessary to provide adequate services to individuals aged 45 and over.

The Canada Employment and Immigration Advisory Council (CEIAC) likewise has claimed that, "Most older workers have learned to expect little or no help from their Canada Employment Centres (CECs) in their job search" and are thus "turning to other job placement and counselling services, where they exist, or embarking on their job searches" (CEIAC, 1985: 17). The Council concluded that community-based and -operated employment agencies were more effective for older workers than the CECs (CEIAC, 1986: 12).

Neither the study by Dunn nor that of the CEIAC are methodologically rigorous. For example, there were no comparison groups or post-program information collected and presented. Both studies are essentially formative evaluations looking at operating processes and relationships within CECs.

3.3 Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program

The Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program (CMITP) was an on-the-job training initiative designed to alleviate job shortages of skilled labour as well as provide assistance to workers at risk of becoming unemployed as a result of technological advancements or skills obsolescence. Hence, it had both a reintegration and more proactive integration policy focus. The program subsidized employers for up to 100 percent of the costs of training and up to 85 percent of the trainees' wages. A 12 month follow-up survey of individuals who had either completed or withdrew from CMITP-sponsored training found that all age groups benefited in terms of increases in their employability, although older workers showed the smallest gains. Overall, 40 percent of participants were employed in the year prior to the training and 84 percent had jobs following the training. For those aged 45 and up, 41 percent were employed before the program and 67 percent were employed after the training (Saunders, 1984). Much of the analysis for this study was done at an aggregate level and very little program results were identified for trainees in the older worker category. With respect to the core measure of labour outcome success — employment — it seems reasonable to say that the CMITP had moderate positive effects for program participants (Trebilcock, 1986: 307).

3.4 Canada Manpower Mobility Program

The Canada Manpower Mobility Program (CMMP) sought to promote labour flexibility by offering geographic mobility assistance. According to Trebilcock (1986), the CMMP had moderate to strong positive labour adjustment effects for the general population. Saunders (1984) reached a more critical conclusion, arguing that the program's assistance was not much of an incentive since it covered only a small part of the direct costs of moving. Moreover, the program was appropriate for structural downturns in the economy but not for cyclical causes of unemployment. Saunders also pointed out that other government policies, such as regional development grants, served to reduce the effectiveness of the CMMP. The CEIAC noted that only a small number of older workers received assistance under the CMMP; again as a group they were under-represented. The Council suggested that unemployed older workers were reluctant to move because of their established roots in the community through family and friends; a fear of suffering financially on a house sale, especially in a small town or a one-industry community; moving allowances did not cover all the costs; and they were doubtful of there being long-term employment elsewhere to justify the upheaval of the move (CEIAC, 1985).

3.5 Canada and Quebec Pension Plans

Reforms to the Quebec Pension Plan (QPP) and Canada Pension Plan (CPP) in the mid-1980s, allowing working people to receive retirement pensions at age 60, at reduced rates, rather than age 65 have affected retirement decisions and the labour force participation

rate of many older workers. In 1984, when the QPP introduced this form of flexible retirement, about 54,000 people aged 60 to 64, who previously were excluded from the program, took early retirement and applied for their pension benefits. In 1987, when the CPP introduced the same measure, the result was that there were more new retirements under the two pension plans in the 60 to 64 age group than in the 65 and over group (227,000 versus 125,000). This pattern has continued (Akyeampong, 1992).

Besides the major public pension plans of the CPP and QPP, pension standards legislation in nearly all jurisdictions in Canada have been reformed over the last 10 to 15 years. Among the reforms has been the creation of greater portability of pension benefits which, if anything, would seem to support the mobility of older workers.

3.6 Community Futures

The Community Futures program was one of the original programs in the CJS. The primary objective of the program is to facilitate community economic and employment development as well as stabilization and adjustment in non-metropolitan communities most in need. Most clients involved in the training, relocation and self-employment incentive options are male and on average in their 30s. Since older workers were not a target group under the CJS, the major evaluation of the program does not shed any light on the effectiveness of the program for unemployed older workers as compared to other older workers or to younger client groups (HRDC, 1990a). This is doubly unfortunate; first, given that this program combines a re-integration and regeneration policy focus, a somewhat unique mix for Canadian policy in this field; and, secondly, because the program evaluation was fairly rich and sophisticated in its research methodologies.

3.7 Employment Insurance

The Unemployment, now Employment, Insurance Program has been subject to countless evaluations over the years by independent researchers, parliamentary committees, think tanks and federal departmental analysts. Comparative data from the early 1990s suggested that compared to some other OECD countries, but not all, Canadian older workers were making greater use of UI benefits. In 1991, for example, unemployed males 55 to 59 years of age represented 21.6 percent of the total unemployed in Canada, compared to 15.4 percent in the United States, 12 percent in France and 10.7 percent in Sweden. On the other side, the rate in Germany was 27.8 percent and in Britain 30.5 percent (Morrison, 1996).

A study on *The Impact of Unemployment Insurance on Wages, Search Intensity and the Probability of Re-employment* (Cremieux et al. 1996) showed that Unemployment Insurance (UI) benefits provide income that allows workers to conduct a more thorough job search, resulting in a higher wage in their new job. The study found that less educated and younger people are more likely to suffer wage losses in their new jobs. Furthermore, older workers, men, those who worked longer in their last job and those with higher debts or mortgage payments search harder for a new job. In a related study, the same authors found that unemployed individuals who receive UI benefits tend to find new jobs with wages that are 7 to 9 percent higher than the wages of those with no UI benefits.

Earlier evaluations, such as by Trebilcock (1986), judged the labour adjustment effects of UI to range from negative to a weak positive impact. In 1997, the old UI system was fundamentally restructured into the Employment Insurance system. In addition to income benefits and the national employment service, several new re-employment benefits are being introduced — targeted wage subsidies, job creation partnerships, self-employment, targeted earnings supplements and skills loans and grants. New evaluations need to be done to assess, among other issues, the impact of these reforms and greater emphasis on "active" programming for unemployed older workers.

3.8 Industrial Adjustment Service

The Industrial Adjustment Service (IAS) is a federal labour market program with no age-specific eligibility criteria, yet the industries involved "often have a disproportionate number of older workers" (CLMPC, 1990: 33). The IAS is intended to assist employees and employers meet the challenges of industrial change and the disruptions resulting from mass layoffs. Where plant closures occur, the IAS organizes the development of joint consultative committees with representatives from management, labour and the federal government (HRDC, 1993). Direct services to displaced workers include job placement assistance, job search preparation, retraining, and employment and pre-retirement counselling.

The IAS was never formally evaluated by the federal government, although a case study of the impact of a plant closure on older workers, done by a social planning council, found that over 62 percent of the employees terminated were 45 and over (cited in HRDC, 1997). Interviews were held with 39 former union employees, half between the ages of 25 and 44, and half 45 years or over, one year following the layoff. The interviews yielded a number of results with respect to the post-layoff labour market experiences of these younger and older workers. Finding full-time employment was equally challenging for the two age groups. Only 32 percent of laid off younger workers had found full-time employment compared to 30 percent for older workers. Both age groups cited the poor state of the economy (the plant closure took place in Hamilton in 1983) as the reason for not obtaining employment, although their age was also mentioned by older workers as an important factor. Among those who had found employment, older workers were more likely to have obtained a similar position (86 versus 50 percent) yet at a lower wage rate (71 versus 33 percent) and with a worse benefit package (57 versus 17 percent). Nonetheless, they were satisfied with their new positions, happy to have obtained any kind of job. Far fewer of the displaced older workers had enrolled in training or skills upgrading than their younger counterparts (5 versus 21 percent). Generally, these displaced older workers did not see the value of retraining. It is unclear how much weight to give to these findings since it is unclear whether the case study was based on a random sample of the laid off employees.

3.9 National Training Program

This last theme is also apparent with respect to the National Training program in which the participation of older workers has been reported as low. In part, "Older workers themselves appear to lack the incentive to undertake training, particularly training in new

skills. Those with interest in training prefer upgrading or building on their existing skills" (CEIAC, 1985: 17-18). Other reasons the Advisory Council suggests are that entrance requirements to training programs can be too high, especially formal educational levels for some older individuals; training allowances may be too low; CECs do not appear to encourage unemployed older workers to consider training as an option; and, employer attitudes and concerns of not recovering their training dollar investment from older workers. Thus, while Trebilcock (1986: 308) ranked the National Training program as having a moderately positive labour adjustment effect, for older workers a weak positive rating seems more appropriate.

3.10 The Atlantic Groundfish Strategy

The Atlantic Groundfish Strategy (TAGS) was announced in 1994 as a $1.8 billion response package to help restructure the declining fishery industry in Atlantic Canada. The program, which ended in the spring of 1998, provided income support and labour adjustment measures designed to help individuals associated with the groundfish industry in accessing new career training and job opportunities outside of the industry. TAGS is the largest labour force adjustment program ever developed in Canada. It had over 52,000 applications and an eventual client population of 40,000 displaced groundfish fishers, trawler and processing workers.

Compared to other HRDC client groups, the fishers and plant workers displaced by the Atlantic groundfish shutdown have several characteristics that make permanent adjustment out of the industry very difficult:

- relatively low levels of formal education (72 percent with less than high school completed);
- relatively older age profile (65 percent are 40 or over)[1];
- a limited range of transferable job skills;
- living in areas of high and entrenched structural unemployment;
- living in small, rural and often remote communities;
- family and household commitments that constrain mobility; and,
- strong social, economic and cultural ties to communities and their way of life (GTA Consultants and Rowe Consultants, 1998).

The TAGS client population is a relatively older age group. Compared to the Canadian labour force, TAGS clients are under-represented in the under 24 and 25-34 groups, and over-represented in the 35-44, 45-54 and 55 and over groups. TAGS comprised three main program components: labour adjustment, capacity reduction, and community economic development.

The labour adjustment component provided income support to eligible fishers, trawlers and plant workers. As well, services offered under this component included career

[1] In the TAGS client population 37 percent are in the 40-49 age group, 25 percent in the 50-64 group and 3 percent are aged 65 and over.

planning, counselling, mobility and other re-employment related assistance. Labour adjustment measures also offered literacy and basic skills training, support for entrepreneurship and for restoration of the environment. The capacity reduction component related to the restructuring of the fishery industry with the aim of a 50 percent reduction in harvesting and processing capacity. This involved initiatives such as limiting licenses and early retirement incentives for fishers. Following negotiations with the provinces concerned, voluntary early retirement programs were established for TAGS clients who were between the ages of 55 and 64 as of May 1995, and who were able to demonstrate a long-term attachment to the groundfish industry. There were two early retirement programs: the Fishplant Older Worker Adjustment Program which was a joint provincial-HRDC program, and the Atlantic Fishers Early Retirement Program which was a joint provincial-Department of Fisheries and Oceans program. Both programs are providing eligible clients with retirement income until the age of 65.

The third component of TAGS dealt with community economic development. This included activities geared toward ensuring community and individual adjustment, employment creation and economic diversification for affected areas. Financial resources were allocated to help strengthen local infrastructure, to encourage community-level development, to promote entrepreneurship, to support research and information sharing for locality development and develop responses to adjustment problems.

The formative evaluation report of TAGS (GTA Consultants and Rowe Consultants, 1997) suggests that older workers (age 50 and over) were less likely to engage in the adjustment activities offered such as training and skills upgrading. This study found that younger workers were the TAGS clients most apt to attend employment counselling sessions and to support the overall TAGS goals of training and finding employment outside of the fishery. TAGS clients in the 35 to 54 age group were among those clients most likely to expect to remain employed in the fishery despite the program measures. The evaluation also indicated that many potential TAGS clients did not apply for the early retirement programs because they did not understand the related material provided to them, or did not trust the information contained in that material. The evaluation reported that the information packages regarding early retirement were so complex that even members of the evaluation team had trouble understanding them. Given that many of the prime candidates for early retirement represent the least literate segment of the TAGS client population, this was a serious obstacle to successful adjustment.

A 1996 survey of TAGS participants revealed that only 55 percent of individuals in their 50s and 29 percent of those over the age of 60 had successfully found employment, compared to 80 percent of clients between the ages of 20 and 29. The *TAGS/HRDC Final Evaluation Report* (GTA Consultants and Rowe Consultants, 1998) noted that at the end of 1996, an estimated 12,000 TAGS clients had adjusted out of the groundfish industry either through adjustment or early retirement, while an estimated 28,000 had not. Most of the adjusted clients (68 percent) qualified for EI benefits in 1996, compared with 25 percent of clients who were not adjusted. An estimated 1,492 clients, 4 percent of the total TAGS population and 12 percent of the adjusted population, had taken an early retirement package and were no longer on TAGS. Relative to a comparison group of non-

participants in the TAGS program with similar age, education and other characteristics, TAGS clients were less likely than non-participants to have been employed in 1995 or 1996, and they had lower overall incomes.

Other age related findings can be mentioned. First, adult basic education does not appear to pay off for TAGS clients in terms of immediate labour market adjustment outcomes, but the final evaluation noted that it appears to contribute significantly to encouraging older, less-well educated and less confident clients to try other adjustment options. These clients also reported positive impacts on their families, in particular a greater interest and ability to encourage children to stay in school and complete their education. Second, focus group research revealed that "hard-to-adjust clients", that is, the less educated and older clients, were more willing to participate in, and showed better adjustment outcomes as a result of community-based adjustment programs such as local job creation initiatives. Third, many plant workers were afraid of losing seniority at their plant if they took other employment, and they did not get clear messages on this issue from their plant operators.

3.11 Post-TAGS

In June 1998, as a post-TAGS initiative, the federal government announced $730 million for fishery restructuring and adjustment measures for the Atlantic groundfish industry. These measures include up to $250 million to retire fishing licences; about $180 million in final lump-sum payments to TAGS clients; $135 million in adjustment measures; up to $100 million for community and regional economic development; and, up to $65 million for a federal-provincial cost-shared early retirement program. This last measure, to be called the Atlantic Early Retirement Program, is to be restricted to eligible TAGS clients who are 55 and over as of August 1998, and who do not avail themselves of any other post-TAGS measures. "Based on past experience, the retirement package is likely to be most attractive to older plant workers in areas where plants have closed permanently as well as to older crew members, especially those who worked on vessels removed from the fishery through licence retirement" (Canada, 1998: 4).

4. General Programs with Older Workers as a Target Group

Between general labour market/social programs and adjustment programs specifically for older workers are programs with a broad client base but which contain older workers as a distinct target group. The table below presents four such programs, and indicates their main policy goal, definition of older workers for eligibility, and labour adjustment effects.

TABLE 7

Program	Target Group's Policy Goal	Labour Definition	Adjustment Effects
Employability Improvement Program	Re-integration	45 and older	strong positive
Industry and Labour Adjustment Program	Re-integration Compensation	45 and older 50 to 64	weak negative
Outreach	Re-integration	45 and older	weak positive
Human Rights Codes	Integrative	varies up to 64 or 65	negative to weak positive

As a share of the client population of these programs, older workers represent at most between 25 to 37 percent in the Employability Improvement Program (EIP); at least 40 percent of the ILAP programs; and about 23 percent of Outreach participants in 1988-89 when the evaluation was done. With respect to human rights commissions, new complaints to the Canadian Human Rights Commission, for example, alleging age as the grounds of discrimination has averaged around 10 percent of all complaints in the 1990s until 1997, when they jumped to 25 percent largely the result of a Federal Court of Canada ruling on mandatory retirement in the Canadian Forces (CHRC, 1997). Across provincial and territorial commissions, the pattern is similar in that age-related complaints represent a modest minority of complaints.

4.1 Employability Improvement Program

Employability Improvement Program (EIP) was established in 1991, as one of four programs under the Employment Programs and Services replacing the Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS), to provide employment development services for individual workers who face labour market difficulties but are motivated to work. EIP offers a mix of programming options which include counselling, training, work experience, mobility assistance and income support. Traditionally under-represented in the labour force, EIP client groups are persons with disabilities, youth, women, visible minorities, less educated persons, and social assistance recipients. Older workers, though relatively well represented in the overall labour force, were also added as a target group.

A 1995 evaluation (HRDC, 1995) measured the labour market outcomes of these seven target groups in the three main components of EIP — Job Opportunities (JO), Project-based Training (PT) and Purchase of Training (POT). JO provides a wage subsidy to employers who hire participants so that these clients can obtain training and work experience leading to long-term employment. PT provides classroom and on-the-job training to clients who require a high degree of assistance with life skills training, job search and skills training, and job placements. Under POT, clients receive training to learn new job skills, primarily vocational in nature. Training may be purchased under three mechanisms: government to government, private sector coordinating bodies, and Canada Employment Centres (CEC). Clients are eligible for income support through employment insurance or training allowances. Methodologically, the program evaluation used a quasi-experimental design. A relatively large sample of clients (n=6,756) was analyzed against a comparison group (n=5,513). Limitations of the research were that non-labour effects, and effects over the long-term were not addressed.

In the evaluation study's measurement period (July 1991 to January 1994), older participants (age 41 and older) comprised approximately 25 percent of clients in the JO option, 26 percent of those in the PT option and 37 percent of those in the POT component. Across all three options, most of these older participants were in the 41 to 50 age group. The evaluation used four measures of effectiveness related to clients' experiences in the labour market after participating in EIP: annual weeks working, annual earnings, use of unemployment insurance and use of social assistance. In other words, the extent to which participants reduced their reliance on social safety net income programs and increased their attachment to the labour force.

The evaluation of EIP found that older workers benefited in all program components more than younger clients. Older workers along with all other target groups had significant gains in weeks working and in annual earnings under all three options. They realized their greatest gains in absolute terms from POT. Relative to the other six target groups, older participants had the highest increase in earnings under the PT option. In general, older participants achieved greater absolute gains than youth, less educated and women, and smaller gains than the visible minorities, disabled and social assistance recipients target groups.

The evaluation revealed that use of government provided employment counselling was less than expected and less than satisfactory. Only 44 percent of EIP participants reported receiving counselling from a CEC office in the two years prior to entering the program. This counselling took such forms as training referrals and information about job opportunities. Other participants received such assistance from third party delivery agencies. Recipients across all groups rated this employment counselling from CECs as marginally adequate or successful. By contrast, during the program client satisfaction with the quality of the training component was consistently high across several aspects, ranging from 75 to 86 percent. The completion rate by clients in all three program components was also high, ranging from 85 to 90 percent.

The study also found that clients in the training options (PBT and POT) experienced reductions in the number of weeks on unemployment insurance and social assistance, ranging from two to seven weeks. Those in the JO option, with the wage subsidy, also experienced modest reductions in social assistance use after the program but not for unemployment insurance. In the evaluation, no breakdown by target groups is given on this finding, nor are any reasons offered. One possible explanation is that the wage subsidy enables clients to gain some employment and earnings, thus reducing their need and eligibility for social assistance, but that their employment is seasonal or cyclical and associated with bouts of unemployment. In summary, the EIP has had a substantial positive impact on employability for older participants as well as several other target groups.

The gains for EIP clients were greater than for participants in similar programs in the former Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS). Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC) management, in their formal response to the evaluation report, identified three reasons for this improvement in results over comparable CJS programs. One is that EIP clientele tend to be older, better educated and have more work experience. The CJS was funded from general revenues and concentrated on the long-term unemployed and groups wishing to enter the labour force. EIP is funded, in substantial measure, with UI funds and so more claimants are people who have been recently employed. A second reason is that EIP is a more client-centered approach in terms of the selection of clients and the matching of their labour market needs with interventions based on local circumstances and delivered through partnership arrangements. Third, EIP has built on lessons and experience from CJS such as the results-based practices with the national client follow-up surveys.

4.2 Industry and Labour Adjustment Program

The Industry and Labour Adjustment Program (ILAP), a federal initiative in effect from 1981 to 1984, was intended to encourage industrial restructuring and worker adjustment in communities affected by large scale layoffs. Under ILAP, laid-off workers entering training programs for high demand occupations were provided with living allowances that exceeded their UI entitlements. ILAP also administered a mobility assistance fund that offered displaced workers with up to $9,000 for relocating to find new employment. The program included, as well, a direct job creation strategy that provided affected workers who had exhausted their UI benefits with temporary employment at a rate which was 20 percent higher than that of the provincial minimum wage. To promote industrial adjustment at the level of the firm, ILAP offered interest-free loans to businesses for a maximum of 50 percent of the capital costs associated with undertaking, expanding or restructuring new projects.

ILAP had two age-specific measures for older participants, one oriented to re-integration to the labour force, the other to compensation and likely exit to retirement. For displaced workers aged 45 and over, ILAP provided a portable wage subsidy of $2.00/hour for up to twelve months, tenable anywhere in Canada. To qualify, displaced older workers must have had at least two years of employment in the last ten years within the affected industry (thus including seasonal, cyclical and part-time forms of employment), and faced limited

opportunity for fast re-employment. The wage subsidy was paid to the employer and the position obtained was not to displace any other workers. For displaced workers aged 50 to 64, ILAP offered early retirement benefits once unemployment benefits had run out. To qualify, displaced workers had to have been employed in the industry for at least 10 years before layoff and have no real prospect of new employment. They could then receive a pre-retirement benefit of 60 percent of their average weekly insurable earnings prior to layoff until they obtained work or reached age 65.

In an assessment of ILAP and other adjustment measures, Saunders (1984) regarded it as an improvement over earlier measures such as the Canada Manpower Mobility Program (examined in the previous section) and the Labour Adjustment Benefits program (to be discussed in the next section) in that it extended coverage to additional industries affected by change and decline. However, Saunders concluded that the wage subsidy and job creation strategies were unlikely to yield any lasting impacts on re-employment. While the mobility assistance amount was three-times what had been available under the Canadian Manpower Mobility Program (CCMP), it was still inadequate by not offsetting any losses incurred by relocated workers in home equity due to the depressed real estate market; neither was any financial assistance offered to workers below the age of 55. Due to what he saw as a rather meagre budget, Saunders argued that ILAP could offer aid to only a small number of affected communities and then for only a short time.

Of approximately 18,650 displaced workers eligible for ILAP over the 1981-1983 period, less than a third actually applied or qualified. Only 637 workers participated in training and received living allowances; 2,354 participated in the community employment program; 1,721 portable wage subsidy vouchers were issued, but only 175 older workers became re-employed; and, mobility allowances were granted to just 108 workers. With respect to the pre-retirement benefit, of 1,078 older workers deemed eligible, just 489 claims were made and only 144 were allowed (Trebilcock, 1986: 59). These figures show a very low level of program take-up and success in labour adjustment. Trebilcock (1986: 63) concluded that ILAP, "was short term in its objectives and appears to have made little progress in facilitating longer-term structural or labour adjustments. Most of the assistance appears to have been granted to firms to induce them to maintain employment in the designated communities or to locate in these communities, while direct assistance to labour appears to have been directed principally at creating temporary employment opportunities in the distressed communities."

4.3 Outreach

Established in 1973, Outreach was an experimental program to offer specialized counselling and job placement services to individuals unable to benefit from the existing network of CECs. Outreach projects were sponsored by community-based organizations and funded in part or in whole by the federal government. Projects were intended to improve the employability and self-reliance of various target groups through various activities. Client support activities were directed at women, long-term unemployed, youth, visible minorities and recent immigrants. Active assistance projects served clients who were more "job-ready" in that they had skills, but faced barriers related to their group.

These client groups were persons with disabilities, ex-offenders and older workers. The establishment of mini-CECs was a third component directed at natives and isolated communities, groups that were not normally served by mainstream CECs.

A 1990 evaluation of Outreach (HRDC, 1990b) addressed the impacts of program activities and compared their effectiveness against those of mainline CECs. In a systematic and fairly comprehensive analysis, the study found that as a target group, older workers appeared to benefit relatively little in terms of increased job placements, increases in overall earnings, better wages following program participation, decreased dependence on income programs, perceived self-reliance, and enhanced awareness of other employment services. Target groups that did benefit significantly were immigrants, women and youth. Older workers demonstrated relatively strong improvements only in job satisfaction after their participation in the program. That is, older participants were more likely to be satisfied with the jobs they found after Outreach compared to before the program. They were also generally satisfied with the employment services received.

Other than having low costs per placement, projects for older workers were unexceptional in their performance. This low cost ratio was likely the result of most older worker clients not being interested in training or career planning, and thus not requiring many interviews with staff. Older workers had the lowest "flow-rate" or client turnover in Outreach activities. This reflects the fact that fewer older participants were placed in training programs or referred to other employment agencies. The evaluation team concluded that CECs would have to alter their services considerably if they were to more fully accommodate the labour market needs of older clients. For older workers, as well as for immigrants and the long-termed unemployed, employer contact was the most effective route for job placements. Finally, the Outreach program evaluation observed that, "if the program is to continue its support of projects for older workers (or, given the emerging increased priority associated with senior citizens, even increase this support) it will have to examine its purpose for doing so. Currently projects for older workers serve, to an extent, as casual work placement clubs rather than long-term placement services. Is this a goal of the program? How else should older workers be served in the coming decade?" (HRDC, 1990b: 58).

4.4 Human Rights Codes and the Charter

Federal, provincial and territorial human rights codes, as well as the Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms, may also be thought of as general programs which have older workers as one of the target groups within their client base. All the human rights codes operative in Canada seek to prohibit discrimination on the basis of age by employers in regards to hiring, pay and other aspects of employment.

Most of this field is under provincial jurisdiction in relation to property and civil rights, and trade and commerce. Human rights commissions address age discrimination through education, the investigation of complaints, conciliation, arbitration and, if necessary, adjudication. In addition, section 15 of the Charter provides that every individual is equal before and under the law and has the right to equal protection and equal benefit of the law

without discrimination based on age, among other grounds. Nonetheless, the Charter and the codes do not preclude limitations or exclusions based on age if a *bona fide* occupational requirement can be demonstrated. The Supreme Court of Canada has upheld mandatory retirement laws where they exist in the country.

The Canadian Human Rights Commission has repeatedly asked the federal government to remove provisions in their own *Human Rights Act* that allows mandatory retirement. While human rights laws seem to promise an integrative policy orientation toward older workers, "they do little to accommodate the needs of older workers or to provide guidance in the management of an aging work force" (Tindale, 1991: 41). Aitken (1995: 6) claims that, "Older workers are often passed over for promotions and training opportunities and, despite seniority policies, are often the first to be dumped in a downsizing exercise." Aitken considers mandatory retirement blatant discrimination and suggests that the Supreme Court decision should be revisited.

5. *Programs Specifically for Older Workers*

It has been observed in the literature that government programs in Canada directed wholly at older workers are rare or non-existent (CEIAC, 1985). LeBlanc and McMullin (1997: 297) state that the Program for Older Worker Adjustment (POWA) initiative, terminated in 1997, was the only Canadian program designed specifically with older workers in mind. It is fair to suggest that programs specifically for older workers, employed and unemployed, are not all that common, but it is misleading to state that such programs are non-existent. Over the last 25 years there have been several such programs, which are listed in Table 3 on the following page. Even with the demise of POWA, at least one small federal program, Options 45+, is in effect today as well as NB Job Corps, a federal-provincial initiative.

5.1 Adjustment Assistance Benefits Program

Canadian experience with labour adjustment programs for unemployed older workers goes farther back than many people perhaps realize. The Adjustment Assistance Benefits (AAB) Program was created as part of the Canadian Textile Policy introduced in 1970. Its rationale was to compensate workers in the textile and clothing industries displaced or dislocated as a result of federal government tariff reductions and other trade policy decisions. For employees unable to find work at comparable wages, the AAB Program offered pre-retirement benefits to those workers between the ages 54 to 65. Benefits were meant to be a safety net or last resort source of income for these workers.

Trebilcock (1986: 87) has described the program elements as follows: "To be eligible, workers had to have been employed for 10 of the previous 15 years in either the textile or clothing industries and had to have worked 1,000 hours in each of those 10 years. Benefits were calculated, like unemployment insurance benefits, at two-thirds of average weekly earnings in the 20-week period prior to layoff and were only payable after regular unemployment-insurance benefits had expired." To qualify for benefits, layoffs had to be for at least four months in duration and involve at least 50 employees or 10 percent of a firm's work force. "In order to prevent older workers from opting for early retirement when they might have productive years of employment remaining, eligibility was granted only to those determined to be incapable of being placed, retrained or relocated, or to those who had accepted employment at a wage less than their previous insurable earnings" (Trebilcock, 1986: 87-88).

TABLE 3
Programs Specifically for Older Workers

Program	Client Group's Policy Goal	Labour Definition	Adjustment Effects
Adjustment Assistance Benefits	Compensation	54-65	weak positive
Job Finding Clubs	Re-integration	45 and over	moderate positive
Labour Adjustment Benefit	Compensation	54-65	weak positive
NB Job Corps	Re-integration Regeneration	50-65	moderate to strong positive
Options 45+	Integration	45 and over	unknown[2]
Program for Older Worker Adjustment	Compensation	55-64	weak negative
Transitions	Re-integration	45 and over	weak positive

It is hard to assess the impacts and effectiveness of the AAB Program as either an adjustment or compensation measure because the federal government, following a period of layoffs in the clothing and textile sectors over the 1964-75 period, introduced new import quotas on clothing. By the late 1970s, these quotas restored 15,000 jobs in that sector and a smaller number in the textile sector. Trebilcock is critical of the AAB and the broader Textile Policy in that new measures were not developed to increase worker mobility or to make it financially rewarding for people to move out of textile production. Limited resources were allocated for employment training and redeployment. Take-up of the AAB Program by those who were eligible was very limited. In a related study of workers who lost their jobs in the clothing, textile and a few other industries in the mid-1970s, older male workers were unemployed for a mean of 12 to 13 months, while prime-aged males were unemployed for a mean of 5.4 months. Female workers were unemployed for an even longer period (Glenday and Jenkins, 1981).

5.2 Job Finding Clubs

Job Finding Clubs (JFCs) were pilot projects introduced in 1988 as part of federal government efforts to provide further assistance to unemployed older workers who were experiencing difficulties in their job search. The objective of JFCs was to help these workers find suitable employment in the shortest possible time. The method of delivery was to use an intensive group process approach to teach effective job search skills. This approach was based on the premise that unemployed older individuals can more

2 The effects of Options 45+ have not yet been evaluated probably because it is fairly recent. With a focus on research, education and advocacy, its labour effects may be more intangible and longer-term.

effectively conduct their job search independently, and without excessive reliance on government employment support services. It may also have been a response, in part, to the criticisms directed at Canada Employment centre (CEC)s noted earlier in this report. In any event, JFCs were developed on the notion that obtaining employment is itself a full time job which is made easier in a group setting that provides a supportive, motivating and learning environment. All clients involved in the JFCs for older workers were required to be 45 years of age or older, and be willing to actively search for employment. Most clients were referred to JFCs through community agencies or CECs. A total of 698 individuals participated in the pilot between late 1988 and the spring of 1989. Of the clients referred to JFCs, 36 percent were UI recipients and 15 percent were in receipt of social assistance.

A 1989 study of the JFCs reported that three months following their implementation, 70 percent of older worker clients had been placed into employment, with over 80 percent of the jobs obtained being full-time employment (Gibson and Mills, 1989). Only 8 percent of the clients left the program early. The study found that the job placements were obtained, for the most part, through the clients' own efforts rather than by referrals to employers from CEC or other agency counsellors. The most frequently cited source used by clients for employment leads was personal contacts through family, friends and acquaintances. Of those clients finding employment through the JFCs, 62 percent did so with jobs that paid an average of 15 percent less than their previous position, while 38 percent of the jobs obtained by clients paid equal or higher salaries than their previous jobs.

These are mixed but overall fairly positive labour market results in the re-integrating unemployed individuals into the labour market in a timely manner. It seems likely that dependence on income transfers, such as UI and social assistance, also declined among those participants who found a new job. Unfortunately, no comparison group was included in the study's research design and the program effects focus on the short-run. The study concluded that JFCs provided encouragement to older job seekers who had experienced frustration and discouragement in searching for new employment.

5.3 Labour Adjustment Benefit Program

The Labour Adjustment Benefit Program (LAB), established in 1972, was a compensatory measure. It provided financial assistance to displaced older workers, aged 54 and over, who had lost their job as result of a layoff in designated industries in selected communities. The program provided income benefits to these workers after their Unemployment Insurance (UI) benefits had been exhausted. This income support was for up to 60 percent of their insurable earnings in the last twenty weeks prior to the layoff. LAB benefits were reduced by the amount of income earned from employment, and eligibility continued until the recipient reached the age of 65, the "normal retirement age" and become eligible for Canada or Quebec Pension Plan benefits, Old Age Security and possibly other supports.

In his research, Saunders (1984) criticized LAB on several points. First, the eligibility criteria for clients was highly restrictive. Eligible workers had to have been employed with

a firm which laid off 10 percent of its workforce or 50 people in the past 12 months. Second, the program had "overly narrow sectoral restrictions" — the workers must have been laid off from the textiles, clothing, footwear or tanning industries *and* the layoff had to be due to import competition or industrial restructuring related to government policy. Consequently, LAB was *de facto* a central Canada program, with most of the program spending expended in Quebec and much of the rest in Ontario. Third, the program did not take account of such variables as the regional rate of unemployment or the proximity of firms and workers to a large urban centre and labour market. Finally, there was a high tax-back of LAB benefits, with an "implicit marginal tax rate of 60 percent on post-layoff earnings" (Saunders, 1984: 29). Interestingly, Trebilcock (1986: 317) judged the adjustment effects of LAB to be moderate positive, though he offers little evidence to support that assessment. Perhaps because of the restrictive nature of LAB, it was replaced in 1982 by the ILAP which was examined in the previous part of this report.

5.4 NB Job Corps

Implemented in 1994 under the federal Strategic Initiatives program, NB Job Corps seeks to test innovative ideas about social security reform. Initially a three-year federal-provincial cost-shared pilot project, in 1997 NB Job Corps was extended for a fourth and fifth year. The costs of the program, up to $80 million, are shared equally between Canada and New Brunswick. Much of this funding will be money diverted from social assistance programs used to support potential NB Job Corps participants. NB Job Corps works with non-profit, private and public sector (municipal and provincial) host organizations to provide work placements to older workers aged 50 to 65. Participation is voluntary.

To be eligible, older workers must be below a total family income of $20,000 a year, be a displaced worker, or be eligible to receive EI benefits or social assistance. The program provides 1,000 eligible individuals a work placement with a project host employer for a period of six months a year. Types of work include silviculture, nature trail development, upgrading of beaches and environmental projects. In return, participants receive income support on the form of a guaranteed annual income of approximately $12,000. Participants receive $46 for each day they are at work during the six months they are active with a host organization. For the remaining six months, during which participants are not active with a host employer, they receive a prorated amount that reflects the total income provided during the active period. Any EI benefits above $8,000 a year received by other family members is deducted from the NB Job Corps benefits.

The intent is to address the difficulties unemployed older workers face in re-entering the workforce and the dangers that a cycle of dependency on government income supports may be created and perpetuated. The objectives of NB Job Corps are:

- to provide positive influence on the economic activities of the province through projects which enhance the environment and support community activities, and whose implementation serves to decrease short- and medium-term demands on social support services, while providing an avenue for work not accomplished by other workers;

- to improve the general physical environment of communities, and to assist in the development of infrastructure projects which would not otherwise be possible in the absence of the program;

- to enhance the quality of life of individuals who have been deemed most in need, but unable to find work or to take part in retraining, by providing the opportunity to contribute actively in socially beneficial work and,

- to stimulate and engender a sense of belonging and contribution to the community, resulting in the potential for longer-term labour force or voluntary activity, community involvement and personal well-being of participants and family members.

An interim evaluation done in 1996 of NB Job Corps reported that benefits to both participants and employers have been very significant (HRDC, 1996b). All four program objectives were being met to a large degree. The program has had a positive economic impact on the province and the outputs produced by participants are of substantial value. Econometric estimates indicate that the program has been responsible for higher total incomes than in the pre-program period and has reduced demands on income support programs. Moreover, the report points out that the increased entitlement to the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) that the program generates will reduce future dependency on passive support programs. The work completed by participants has improved the general physical environment and projects were developed which could not have been completed otherwise. The program reached the specified target group. In 1994, for example, the average age of a participant was 56 years. Approximately 60 percent of the participants have been social assistance recipients.

The evaluation also found that the program is operated at a reasonable level of administrative cost, appears to be flexible and adaptable, and produces results in a non-demeaning manner. The types of work placements offered tend to be in or near the participant's own community; and appear to be consistent with the skill levels of participants and with the kinds of occupations and industries in which they had been employed in the past.

On a critical note, the evaluation found that even though the program does not have an explicit tax rate on earnings on the "inactive period", there is little employment in that period. That is, participants and other members of their family can still work at other jobs and earn other income without having that money taken off their NB Job Corps benefits. While some of the participants remained active through volunteer work, in fact at a higher level than the comparison group, only 15 percent of participants worked for pay outside of the six-month active period. This finding is in contrast to initial expectations about the work incentive effect of this aspect of the program's design.

5.5 Options 45+

Options 45+ is another innovative programming approach to older workers introduced by Human Resources Development Canada (HRDC) in 1996-97. The policy goals of the

program appear to be a blend of re-integration and integration. It aims to deal with work-related needs of older Canadians aged 45 and over. Program activities include public education to communicate and advocate for the skills of older workers, in part by tackling ageist beliefs and myths about the abilities of older workers. The program also aims to encourage employers to review their policies on recruitment, promotion, training, redundancy and retirement, with a view of eliminating unfair discriminatory practices.

Two recent research studies sponsored under Options 45+ found that employment discrimination against older workers is a real problem in Canada. One of the studies was a survey of human resources career centres, and showed that individuals 60 and over have the most difficulty finding jobs, and those in 45 to 59 years of age have the second greatest difficulty. A second study surveyed Canadian employers and found that 30 percent of employer respondents had an age beyond which they would consider a person too old to hire. For small firms this was 57, and for larger firms, 59. The Canadian Human Rights Commission, in its 1997 annual report, states that these findings are confirmed by complaints they receive. Most complaints about age discrimination involve "unfounded stereotyping about the abilities of older workers. This group has also encountered problems with job retention when an organization downsizes or restructures" (CHRC, 1997: 4).

5.6 Program for Older Worker Adjustment

A 1986 report to the then Minister of Employment and Immigration by the departmental Advisory Council proposed that the federal government institute a program concentrating on the re-integration of older workers into the labour force, in contrast to the more compensation oriented approaches of the LAB and Industry and Labour Adjustment Program (ILAP). The Council also proposed, as a last resort, an income maintenance safety net, which they suggested be called the Program for Older Worker Adjustment (POWA). The Council saw POWA as the last layer in an older worker safety net system which included severance pay, a workplace pension, UI, CEC job search assistance, employment services and programs such as training and mobility assistance, and finally POWA. The Council's expectation was that only a small percentage of unemployed older workers should need this program, and only remain in the program until they found or created a job for themselves or reached the age of 65.

The federal government's expectation of the POWA, when funding was first announced, was that the program would complement other federal labour adjustment programs like Community Futures; and, that as a shared federal-provincial initiative, unlike LAB, POWA would provide "the opportunity for an integrated and comprehensive approach in which provincial governments and employers can contribute to assisting with older worker adjustment" (Finance Canada, 1986: 25).

Actual experience, however, shows that POWA, which was established in 1987 and terminated in 1997, differed in design and effect from both the Advisory Council's and the federal government's vision of POWA serving as a bridge between unemployment and re-entry to the work force or, failing that, to retirement. The real POWA was a passive safety

net program which, evaluation studies have shown, did not have a positive effect on the reemployment of older workers.

POWA was a joint federal-provincial cost-shared program. The federal government contributed 70 percent of the costs and the participating provinces contributed the other 30 percent. At the time POWA was terminated, seven of the ten provinces had POWA agreements with Ottawa. Delivery of POWA benefits was the responsibility of private sector insurance companies contracted by the federal government to provide monthly annuity payments to recipients until these individuals reach the age of 65.

Under POWA, workers from designated layoffs were eligible for benefits if they were between 55 and 64 years of age; had exhausted their UI benefits; were legally entitled to work in Canada; and had participated in the labour force for at least 13 of the past 20 years, with a minimum of 750 hours of employment annually. Layoffs were designated based on the size of the layoff relative to the size of the affected community; the amount of economic disruption expected from the layoff; and the proportion of older workers associated with the layoff. Benefits levels for each POWA client varied depending on their specific financial needs. For all clients, the level of POWA benefits was reduced dollar for dollar of benefits from private pension income.

Studies by academics and policy advisers have noted drawbacks with POWA. These criticisms are that the funding was limited and payments inadequate; the lack of uniform coverage across the country because some provinces and both territories did not participate in the program, thus excluding some communities and workers in need; subjectivity in determining what did and did not qualify as eligible layoffs; lack of a labour market re-integration component to the program; lack of involvement by unions and employers in the development and management of the program; and that women were less likely than men to be eligible given that POWA concentrated on major permanent layoffs in the manufacturing, trade and mining sectors (CLMPC, 1990: 30; Tindale, 1991; LeBlanc and McMullin, 1997). "The POWA program is a thumb-in-the-dike approach to older worker unemployment, and it underscores the absence of a coherent workplace strategy", concluded Tindale (1991: 51) in a report to the National Advisory Council on Aging.

A 1996 evaluation of POWA measured the post-layoff labour market and lifestyle experiences of over 1,000 program participants compared to a group of over 600 non-participating laid off older workers with similar characteristics (HRDC, 1996a). The methodology for this evaluation is rigorous. Several kinds of evidence were collected and analyzed, examining both labour and non-labour effects over a period of up to four years after the layoffs. The study found that most POWA participants were involved in major layoffs, mainly from closures of large companies in Quebec and Ontario. POWA participants were mostly males (73 percent) and with low levels of formal education (75 percent did not complete high school) and trade certification. The workers were concentrated in the manufacturing sector, especially in low-skilled, labour-intensive industries. The average age of POWA participants was nearly 59 years.

Not surprisingly, the evaluation concluded that POWA functions primarily as a passive support strategy which provides much needed financial support to unemployed older workers who have exhausted any severance and UI benefits. Perhaps understandably, given their average age and employment histories in low-skilled industries, participants had little interest in training. Ten percent or less of workers in both the participant group and the comparison group took formal training lasting more than 40 hours following their layoff. The evaluation reported that POWA was a disincentive to labour market participation. Indeed, the labour market outcomes of POWA were disappointing. Only 19 percent of POWA participants found work after layoff compared to 39 percent in the comparison group of older workers, and only 4 to 7 percent of participants were currently employed when the evaluation was done, compared to 20 percent in the comparison group. POWA clients were also less likely to find full-time and permanent jobs with relatively higher earnings and fringe benefits than the comparison group. Both groups experienced a substantial loss of earnings in the post-layoff period, but more pronounced for POWA clients, with the average earned income diminishing each year following layoff. Most of the program participants and comparison group members claimed Canada Pension Plan (CPP)/Quebec Pension Plan (QPP) retirement benefits at age 60. In light of the initial expectations of this program, it is worth noting that the HRDC evaluation of POWA does not discuss the program's effects, if any, on other federal labour programs nor on facilitating federal-provincial and/or business-government coordinated action with respect to older worker adjustment.

5.7 Transitions

The Transitions program is a provincial initiative for older workers, introduced in Ontario in 1988. An active measure for providing adjustment assistance, Transitions provides workers aged 45 and over who have been given a layoff notice or who have been permanently displaced with a $5,000 training credit. The credit is available to cover training expenses with a new employer, private training agency or public institution over a two-year period. Training is to focus on reintegrating the recipient into the labour market. In 1993, about 12,000 older individuals were being trained as result of the program. A program evaluation of Transitions reported that the program met with only modest success in developing "a training culture" among unemployed older workers. A survey of the program clients found that the use of the training credit or voucher did not have significant labour market impacts for them in terms of job search, the acquisition of employment in a new field or their attitudes towards participating in training activities. The evaluation study did not use a comparison group and did not venture to estimate the longer term impacts of the program on the reemployment of these older workers (HRDC, 1997).

6. *Lessons Learned*

In drawing lessons from past and present programs for unemployed older workers, the experiences surveyed in this report inform us about a number of issues, caution and perhaps warn us about what to avoid or not repeat, and encourage us to build on certain other policy directions.

6.1 Informing Us: Some General Findings

From the evaluation studies and general literature, we learn that older workers, both those employed and unemployed, face several barriers to employment, counselling, training and re-employment opportunities. These barriers arise from different sources — attitudinal, economic, financial, personal and social — and thus require a multi-faceted policy response. To be effective, any programming must recognize and address the obvious diversities within the older worker population. Like any other demographic or socially defined category of people, older workers comprise a heterogeneous group. In relation to the labour market, older workers vary in their occupations, sectoral locations, work histories, economic status, reasons for leaving work and for returning to work, as well as retirement income plans and prospects. Adjustment experiences are affected by levels of income and formal education, and with age. "Younger" older workers, those in the 45 to 54 age group, have a much higher rate of labour force participation than those in the 55 to 64 age group, and appear to utilize employment support services and other adjustment measures more readily. In general, older workers in the 55 to 64 group have been more seriously affected by economic downturns, dislocations and restructuring as well as age discrimination.

The traditional retirement age of 65 has become less standard in the past 15 to 20 years. The average age for retirement among Canadians is now 62, and for many occupations it is lower. For some, usually those with better health and higher education, the labour force exit and retirement processes may extend over several years with phased retirement, a change of occupations or a post-retirement return to work. Transition from work to retirement may be more flexible today, but it is still an abrupt change for many older workers. With reforms to the Canada Pension Plan (CPP) and Quebec Pension Plan (QPP) in the 1980s, the receipt of retirement benefits can now begin at 60 rather than 65 and may be delayed until age 70. Evidence presented earlier suggests that these reforms have influenced the timing of retirement decisions for many older workers.

The shift from work to retirement can be a sudden and disconcerting experience. An international study has noted that, "in the vast majority of cases, the transition from work to retirement is a relatively abrupt one, especially for men. ... There are few opportunities to move to lighter work or to part-time work as an intermediate phase. Those who are self-employed have more chances to adjust their work patterns to enable a gradual withdrawal from employment" (OECD, 1995: 120). Moreover, the relation between retirement and unemployment is ambiguous for some older individuals. Given the extent of government downsizing and corporate restructuring measures in recent times, the distinction between

early retirement and early labour force exit is less than clear-cut (LeBlanc and McMullin, 1997).

A recent report on the potential benefits of, and the likely opportunities for phased-in retirement among Canadians notes that the present design of most occupational pension plans, as well as the CPP, are not conducive to a phased-in approach to retirement. Regulations governing workplace pensions in both the public and private sectors are barriers to a more graduated approach to earning partial pension credits as well as drawing partial pension benefits. In addition, the proportion of Canadians who could afford to go into semi-retirement rather than remain working full time, is deemed to be small given the lack of pension coverage in much of the private sector and the limited use of retirements savings plans (HRDC, 1998).

The literature and research inform us also that most older workers want to work and, if they become unemployed, want to obtain a new job (Aitkens, 1995; Marshall, 1995). Based on focus group discussions with older workers across Canada and meetings with a number of employer and labour organizations, the Advisory Council to the federal employment minister found that, "For the majority, only full-time employment would satisfy their economic, social and psychological needs. Others view part-time employment as a means of supplementing their pension or investment income and a few seek opportunities to remain active through volunteer work and other community activities" (CEIAC, 1985: 11). Some of the evaluation studies in probing the motives of clients in participating in employment development programs similarly found that most older clients wanted to find a new job.

The older worker policy field in Canada, if broadly defined as in this report, has largely involved provisions with a re-integration orientation. For about half (10) of the programs surveyed, their prime focus was on promoting the re-employment of unemployed workers; about another quarter of the programs had this as one of their objectives or components. Several programs had compensation as their main orientation — compensating for the loss of work and exhausted UI benefits by offering pre-retirement income support. Unemployment Insurance (UI)/Employment Insurance (EI) illustrates a compensation program which has been moving closer toward the re-integration approach. Relatively few programs in Canada for unemployed older workers take the form of community regeneration or integration, although the Atlantic Groundfish Strategy (TAGS) and NB Job Corps are recent and notable examples.

In terms of program design, most services and benefits older workers receive are delivered through general programs rather than targeted programs. LeBlanc and McMullin (1997: 301) suggest that "social programs which appear to be age-neutral, are structured in such a way that some age groups are disadvantaged relative to others" As a consequence, they argue that many older displaced workers fall through the cracks of policy, leaving them with financially insecure futures. Future research and evaluation studies, both of a quantitative and qualitative kind, need to focus on the effectiveness of the general programs for improving the employability of older clients, alleviating or avoiding disadvantages and strengthening retirement prospects.

Policy Goals	Ineffective Impacts (n=14)	Effective Impacts (n=5)
Compensation	6	0
Re-integration	10	5
Regeneration	2	1
Integrative	1	1

Note: Some programs contained more than one policy orientation so the totals exceed the 19 programs evaluated for labour adjustment effects.

6.2 Cautioning Us: What Has Not Worked Well

Much of what has been tried in programming for older workers is not inspiring. Of the 21 programs reviewed, 19 programs were rated by evaluation reports, analytic studies and other studies surveyed here (CPP/QPP and Options 45+ were not). Of these, 14 were in the negative to weak positive range of labour adjustment effects, while the other five were assessed as having moderate to strong positive effects. Table 4 presents the relation between policy goals and the labour market results of the programs.

Given the small sample of programs, this table and the next must be interpreted with care, especially in the policy categories of regeneration and integrative approaches. In Table 4, the compensatory programs have all been rated as ineffective from the perspective of facilitating the timely re-employment of displaced older workers. This may seem harsh since some of these programs were aimed at workers aged 54 and over Adjustment Assistance benefits (AAB), the Labour Adjustment Benefit Program (LAB) and Program for Older Worker Adjustment (POWA). Furthermore, in the case of the Atlantic Groundfish Strategy (TAGS), clients and their industries and communities face enormous adjustment problems which will take decades to address. Evaluations of POWA indicated, however, that while the program was not designed as a pre-retirement income support scheme, most clients did use it this way. Non-participants were found to be twice as successful as POWA clients in obtaining employment following their layoff. In contrast, the POWA benefits, in combination with other means of public income support, gave POWA recipients higher incomes than non-recipients in the comparison group. Thus, income support programs for unemployed older workers may offer a measure of income stability, but they do little for enhancing opportunities for re-employment.[3] Evaluations of the new EI system will no doubt offer information on the attempt to combine the compensation and re-integration orientations in a large national program for all age groups of the labour force.

[3] Whether income compensation programs encourage early withdrawal for the labour force which may, in turn, be beneficial for improving the labour adjustment of the economy at a macro level is a topic which goes beyond the research examined here and the scope of this report.

Most programs aimed at the re-integration of unemployed older workers, which have been reviewed here, have had unsatisfactory results. Numerous reasons are given in the research literature. These include: overly stringent eligibility criteria which have limited the use of programs by older workers; levels of benefits, such as mobility and retraining allowances, being too low; the limitations of Canada Employment Centres (CEC) in meeting the needs of unemployed older clients; other programs, based on compensation to workers and subsidies to firms, discouraged adjustment; lack of clarity of overall program goals; an emphasis on seasonal or on temporary employment in certain programs; and, a history of piecemeal program responses and frequent changes (CEIAC, 1986; Tindale, 1991; Trebilcock, 1986).

TABLE 5
Labour Market Impacts by Program Design

Type of Program Design	Ineffective Impacts (n=14)	Effective Impacts (n=5)
General	7	2
General with older worker target group	3	1
Programs specific to older workers	4	2

Table 5 reports the labour market impacts in relation to the three types of program design. All four policy goals are essentially found across the program design types.[4] Knowing the form of programming, by itself, does not allow us to predict whether the results will be negative or positive. As Table 5 shows, no one design type is superior to the others. Effective and ineffective programs are evident in all three designs.

These experiences yield a complex set of messages on the issue of mainstream versus segregated programming for older workers. The CEC evaluation study found that only 28 percent of CEC-registered older workers indicated training through the CEC suited their needs. Nonetheless, when asked where they thought employment-related services for older workers should be provided, 85 percent of the sample identified the CEC. Yet, among the people who identified the CEC as the preferred service vehicle, 64 percent stated that services should be received through a specialized CEC for older workers. The rest felt that a regular CEC would be more adequate and alleviate any discrimination which might arise from a separate operation. The evaluation of the Outreach projects for older workers concluded that, compared to regular CECs, the flexible nature of their activities allowed them to more rapidly respond to community needs, to emerging employment related needs, and to new means of delivering employment services.

4 There is one exception. None of the general programs with an older worker target group reviewed here contains the regeneration policy goal.

Research on some of the general programs with multiple goals and some of the general programs with multiple client groups revealed tensions between adjustment assistance, industrial restructuring and community development components. Examples are the Community Futures, Industrial Adjustment Service (IAS) and TAGS. The evaluation of the Outreach program pointed to the challenge of offering services within a general program for several target groups, concluding that "the program's stated goals do not reflect the different needs of the target groups and their associated ideal service approaches. Immigrants are not, and should not, be served in the same way as older workers. ... Consequently, overall goals of the program should promote the necessary diversity in activities and service approaches. In addition, sub-goals related to target groups may be needed."

POWA, as the prime example in Canada to date of a separate program for older workers, also reveals a lesson about the implications of defining eligibility too narrowly. Like some of its predecessor programs, POWA included only large-scale layoffs from industries within its coverage. Consequently, the program excluded some of the most vulnerable older workers in the labour force, namely, those in small and medium-size firms which typically do not have company pension plans, and little or no severance packages and adjustment services. Experience also demonstrates that narrow definitions of eligibility adds to administrative complexity and costs, contributing to an incomplete take-up of program benefits by the intended target group. The lesson, then, is that by broadening the eligibility criteria, or basing eligibility on labour market histories and/or financial needs, rather than on designated layoffs[5], POWA could have benefited a far larger share of older workers experiencing hardship.

6.3 Encouraging Us: What Has Worked Well

Five programs were moderately to strongly positive in facilitating the re-employment of unemployed older workers into the Canadian work force. A summary overview of these programs is presented in Table 6.

While effectiveness does not appear to correspond with program design, there seems a strong connection between policy goal and effective labour market outcomes. None of these programs have or had compensation as a prime focus; instead, they all centre on promoting the re-employment of unemployed older workers. In addition, two of the programs have a complementary, secondary goal of integration or regeneration. In short, all five of these programs represent **active programming** and, in the case of CMITP and NB Job Corps, interactive and proactive provisions. For the federal and provincial governments contemplating what to do in the area of older worker adjustment programming, the general lesson is that income compensation programs like POWA may

5 Designated layoffs were determined under the POWA in relation to the proportion of workers laid off, the size of the layoff by a firm relative to the size of the affected community, and an estimation of the economic disruption expected from the layoff. Other criteria were that laid off workers were: (a) between 55 and 64 years of age, (b) had exhausted their Unemployment Insurance (UI) benefits, (c) were legally entitled to work in Canada, and (d) had participated in the labour force for at least 13 of the past 20 years, with (e) a minimum of 750 hours of employment annually.

offer a degree of financial support to displaced workers aged 55 and older, but they do little if anything for meeting the employment needs and aspirations of most older Canadians looking for work.

TABLE 6
Effective Adjustment Programs for Unemployed Workers
A Summary Overview of Characteristics

Program	Client Group's Policy Goal	Labour Program Type	Client Group
Canadian Jobs Strategy	Re-integration	General	N/A
Canadian Manpower Industrial Training Program	Re-integration, Integrative	General	N/A
Employability Improvement Program	Re-integration	General with a target group	45 and older
Job Finding Clubs	Re-integration	Specific for older workers	45 and older
NB Job Corps	Re-integration, Regeneration	Specific for older workers	50 to 65

Note: N/A means not applicable.

The age group covered is **a wider client population rather than a narrower focus** on "older" older workers of 55 years and over, which has been a feature of the specific compensation programs. Within this active approach, however, three programs [Canadian Jobs Strategy (CJS), Employability Improvement Program (EIP) and CMITP] stress training, while the others [Job Finding Club (JFC) and NB Job Corps] do not, seeking to match existing skills and experience with suitable and available employment. Interestingly, mobility assistance for older workers is not a prominent feature in this set of programs, though it is a component of the EIP. Four of the programs are federal and the other a federal-provincial arrangement. Two of the programs are pilots while the others are or were established programs; and in terms of size of budgetary expenditures, they range from small (JFC) to quite large (CJS and EIP). Three of these programs still exist-EIP, JFCs and NB Job Corps — with EIP as the successor to the CJS.

Partnerships is a characteristic apparent in these programs. The JFC, which used peer counselling and services provided by third parties, placed 70 percent of their clients, most in full time employment. Participants mainly used family, friends and acquaintances for job leads. NB Job Corps is an intergovernmental partnership as well as an inter-sectoral one that places older workers in positions in the municipal, provincial, non-profit and business sectors. In the EIP, clients agree upon an action plan with a designated HRDC authority. EIP rests on the involvement of several training delivery agents — community-based trainers, employers in the private and non-profit sectors, high schools and community colleges, and private training institutions. Along with partnership,

client-centered and community-based approaches are other features common across these programs.

A **client-centered approach** includes such activities as voluntary participation and selection that is based, in part at least, on client motivation; peer mentoring; client involvement in decision-making on employment services; and building on the competencies and capacities of the participants themselves. Initiatives which recognize the specific needs of older workers, or which contain sufficient financial and personal motivation, appear to improve the employability and earnings of this age group. Programs which have not addressed the employment barriers faced by older workers, however, have been found to have little or no positive effect on their labour market experiences.

Not all training is the same nor equally effective. In fact, studies on many of the programs reviewed here found low participation rates of older workers in training services (e.g., CECs, TAGS, Transitions). Moreover, a theme in the literature is that training is not regarded as a worthwhile labour market strategy for unemployed older workers either by most employers or older persons themselves. The evidence suggests that programs that focus on the interests of the older participant and contain motivational strategies have been associated with higher placements for these clients. The POT component of the EIP is effective for older clients with its focus on client's own interests and aptitudes.

A **community-based approach** to re-employment for older workers may entail placements in local organizations, as with the CMITP, JFCs and NB Job Corps; and, locally-delivered services through partnerships and thus attuned to the realities of the local labour market, as with the CJS and even more so with the EIP. The research and literature strongly suggest that community-operated job placement and counselling centres can be quite effective for older workers with respect to job referrals, empathy and support, and adequate job seeking services (Dunn, 1985; CEIAC, 1985, 1986). The final evaluation of TAGS remarked that community attitudes, traditions and organizations are noteworthy influences on adjustment outcomes. Such approaches can also attend to the diverse, backgrounds, needs and skills of older workers in Canada.

In sum, the relatively few effective labour adjustment programs in Canada have varied in program design and certain other features, but all have embraced an active policy orientation toward re-integration, a wide definition of older workers, as well as a delivery system that is client-centered and community-based, with partnerships in implementation. There is also encouraging news in reference to the wider human condition. Positive labour market outcomes tend to reinforce quality of life, desired social policy effects and, depending on the program's goals, promote civic engagement and community capacity-building.

Bibliography

Aitkens, Andrew, "Modern Miracles." in Caledon Institute of Social Policy, *Critical Commentaries on the Social Security Review*. Ottawa: Renouf, 1995, pp. 5-10.

Akyeampong, Ernest B, "Discouraged Workers: Where have they Gone?" *Canadian Economic Observer*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada, Cat, No. 11-010. October 1992, pp. 3.1-3.12.

Betcherman, Gordon, Norm Leckie, and Kathryn McMullen, *Developing Skills in the Canadian Workplace*. Ottawa: Canadian Policy Research Network, 1997.

Canada Employment and Immigration Canada Advisory Council, *Older Workers: An Imminent Crisis in the Labour Market*. Report presented to the Minister of Employment and Immigration Canada, Ottawa: August 1985.

Canada Employment and Immigration Canada Advisory Council, *Charting a Clear Course for a National Older Workers' Program*. A paper presented to the Minister of Employment and Immigration Canada. Ottawa. November 1986.

Canada Employment and Immigration Canada Advisory Council, *The Unemployed Older Worker Phenomenon: A problem that will not go away*. A policy note presented to the Minister of Employment and Immigration Canada. June 1998.

Canada, Government of Canada, "Fishery restructuring and adjustment measures for the Atlantic Groundfish Industry." *News Release*. Ottawa: June 1998.

Canada, Canadian Human Rights Commission, *Annual Report Highlights*, 1997. Web Site: http://www.chrc.ca/ar1997/s_awc_e.html.

Canadian Labour Market and Productivity Centre, *Report of the CLMPC Task Forces*. Ottawa, 1990.

Casey, Bernard, and Gert Bruches, *Work or Retirement? Labour Market and Social Policy for Older Workers in France, Great Britain, the Netherlands, Sweden and the USA*. Aldershot: Gower, 1983.

Cremieux, P-Y., P. Fortin, P. Storer, and M. Van Audenrode, *The Impact of Unemployment Insurance on Wages, Search Intensity and Probability of Re-employment*. Evaluation report prepared for Human Resources Development Canada, 1996.

Dunn, Gladys H, *Older Workers Study*. Ottawa: Special Groups and Affirmative Action, Employment and Immigration Canada, 1985.

Finance Canada, *Budget Papers*. Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada. February 26 1986.

Gibson, G. and A. Mills, A, *Job Finding Clubs for Older Workers: Interim Progress Report, Phase I.* Ottawa: Employment and Immigration Canada, 1989.

Glenday, Graham, and G.P. Jenkins, *Labour Adjustment: An Overview of Problems and Policies.* Labour Market Development Task Force, Technical Study No. 11. Ottawa: Supply and Services Canada, 1981.

GTA Consultants, Inc., and Andy Rowe Consultants, *Evaluation of the Atlantic Groundfish Strategy: Final Report of the TAGS/HRDC Formative Evaluation.* Hull: Human Resources Development Canada, 1997.

Human Resources Development Canada, *TAGS/HRDC Final Evaluation Report.* Hull: Evaluation and Data Development, Strategic Policy, HRDC, 1998.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Evaluation of the Community Futures Program: Overview Report.* Hull: Job Creation and Employment Services Division, 1990a.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Evaluation of the Outreach Program: Overview Report.* Hull: Submitted to the Program Evaluation Branch by Gallup Canada, Inc., 1990b.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Evaluation of the Skill Shortages Program.* Hull: Program Evaluation Branch, 1991.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Industrial Adjustment Services: Final Report.* Hull, 1993.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Employability Improvement Program: Program Evaluation.* Hull: Evaluation and Data Development, Strategic Policy, 1995.

Human Resources Development Canada, *Program for Older Worker Adjustment: Evaluation Report.* Hull: Evaluation and Data Development, Strategic Policy, 1996a.

Human Resources Development Canada, *NB Job Corps Interim Impact and Interim Cost-Benefit/Cost-Effectiveness Evaluation.* Prepared for NB Job Corps Evaluation Committee. Evaluation and Data Development, Strategic Policy, 1996b.
Web Site: http://HRDC-DHRC.GC.CA/hrdc/cor...ol/progeval/micro.nbjc_eng.html.

Human Resources Development Canada, *A Review of Programs for Older Worker Adjustment: Technical Report.* Prepared for Nand Tandan, Evaluation Services, Evaluation and Data Development. Ottawa, 1997.

Human Resources Development Canada, "Changing Notions of Retirement: A Phased-In Approach." *Applied Research Bulletin*, Vol. 2, No. 2, 1998. Web site: http://www.hrdc-drhc.gc.ca/hrdc...bulletin.

LeBlanc, L. Suzanne, and Julie Ann McMullin, "Falling through the Cracks: Addressing the Needs of Individuals between Employment and Retirement," *Canadian Public Policy*. Vol. 23, no. 3, 1997, 289-304.

Leckie, Norm, *An International Review of Labour Adjustment Policies and Programs*. Kingston: Queen's University Papers in Industrial Relations, 1993.

Marshall, Victor W, "The Older Worker in Canadian Society: Is There A Future?" in Ellen M. Gee and Gloria Guttman, eds. *Rethinking Retirement*. Vancouver: Gerontology Research Centre, Simon Fraser University, 1995, pp. 51-68.

Morrison, Kelly, *Canada's Older Workers: A Discussion of Labour Market Issues*. Hull: Applied Research Branch, Human Resources Development Canada, 1996.

Ontario Ministry of Labour, *The Displaced Workers of Ontario: How do they fare?* Toronto: Queen's Printer, 1993.

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, *The Transition from Work to Retirement*. Paris: OECD. Social Policy Studies No. 16, 1994.

Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development, *The Labour Market and Older Workers*. Paris: OECD. Social Policy Studies No. 17, 1995.

Prince, Michael J., and James J. Rice, "The Canadian Jobs Strategy: Supply-Side Social Policy," in Katherine Graham, ed. *How Ottawa Spends 1989-90*. Ottawa: Carleton University Press, 1989, pp. 247-87.

Saunders, Ronald S, *Aid to Workers in Declining Industries*. Toronto: Ontario Economic Council, Policy Studies Series, 1984.

Statistics Canada, "Labour force characteristics by age and sex." CANSIM, 1998. Web site: http://www. statcan.80/englishPgdb/People/Labour/labor20b.html.

Tindale, Joseph, *Older Workers in an Aging Workforce*. Report prepared for the National Advisory Council on Aging. Ottawa. Supply and Services Canada, 1991.

Trebilcock, Michael J, *The Political Economy of Adjustment*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1986.

Trueman, Mary, *Training of Older Workers in Canada*. Geneva: ILO Training Discussion Paper No. 22, 1989.